



HIMALAYA, the Journal of the Association for Nepal and Himalayan Studies

Volume 26
Number 1 *People and Environment:
Conservation and Management of Natural
Resources across the Himalaya No. 1 & 2*

Article 20

2006

Women in Tibet edited by Janet Gyatso and Hanna Havnevik; reviewed by Sara Shneiderman

Sara Shneiderman

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.macalester.edu/himalaya>

Recommended Citation

Shneiderman, Sara. 2006. Women in Tibet edited by Janet Gyatso and Hanna Havnevik; reviewed by Sara Shneiderman. *HIMALAYA* 26(1).

Available at: <https://digitalcommons.macalester.edu/himalaya/vol26/iss1/20>

This Research Article is brought to you for free and open access by the DigitalCommons@Macalester College at DigitalCommons@Macalester College. It has been accepted for inclusion in HIMALAYA, the Journal of the Association for Nepal and Himalayan Studies by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@Macalester College. For more information, please contact scholarpub@macalester.edu.



WOMEN IN TIBET

JANET GYATSO AND HANNA HAVNEVIK, EDS.

REVIEWED BY SARA SHNEIDERMAN

With its concise yet broad-sweeping title, Janet Gyatso and Hanna Havnevik's edited volume on *Women in Tibet* is positioned as a definitive contribution to the literature on women's experiences in the Tibetan cultural area. The composition of the volume reflects the diversity of contemporary Tibetan Studies, with chapters by historians, philologists, scholars of comparative religion, and anthropologists, who apply their diverse methodological approaches to a range of chronologically and geographically disparate subjects. This diversity makes for an uneven read: some chapters are in themselves lengthy mini-monographs that present important new ethnographic research (those by Diemberger, Henrion-Dourcy and Barnett); others are tightly argued pieces clearly situated within the author's own discipline (Schaeffer and Makley); while the remaining chapters are lists of notable women within certain domains of Tibetan life (Uebach; Martin and Tsering). Although Gyatso and Havnevik's well-crafted introduction works hard to provide a coherent framing structure by raising overarching theoretical questions about cultural relativism in gender studies, and the methodological challenges of accessing women's experiences, as a whole the book does not live up to its promising title as a comprehensive survey of Tibetan women. Instead, as Gyatso and Havnevik themselves admit, the volume "only provides fragments of the history and diversity of women in Tibet" (24).

Studies of the Tibetan world have generally overemphasized the religious sphere, and the available literature on Tibetan women is no exception. In particular, there is a plethora of books and articles by Western Buddhist women about the power of feminine deities in Tibetan Buddhism, but relatively little material about the lives of actual women in Tibetan contexts. This book is a healthy corrective, with chapters about women in medicine, the performing arts, and politics, in addition to the more predictable contributions on nuns, yoginis, and oracles. The volume also enters new territory by including several scholars conducting groundbreaking research within the contemporary Tibetan Autonomous Region (TAR) of the People's Republic of China (PRC), rather than relying solely on historical sources and/or field research conducted in Himalayan areas outside of political Tibet.

After the introduction, the book is divided into two parts, with Part I focusing on "Women in Traditional Tibet." Helga Uebach looks at how noblewomen of the Tibetan empire from the seventh to ninth centuries are represented in textual materials. Of particular note are her analyses of their political roles and contributions to important monasteries like Samye. Moving ahead chronologically, Dan Martin's article begins by considering the methodological challenges of identifying religious women in the biographical literature of the eleventh to twelfth centuries. He then lists all those whom he has identified, placing

Women in Tibet

Janet Gyatso and
Hanna Havnevik, eds.

London: Hurst &
Co., 2005.

them in the categories of Best-Known Women, Prophets, Disciples, Lineage Holders, Leaders of Popular Religious Movements, Teachers, and Nuns. Finally, he argues that the male teacher Phadampa Sangye and his followers “advocated a particular kind and degree of women’s liberation with strongly Buddhist characteristics” (80), which we might even go so far as to call “feminism.” Picking up on such analytical themes, Kurtis Schaeffer suggests that the “earliest datable Tibetan woman’s autobiography”—that of the Dolpo hermitess Orgyan Chokyi, who lived from 1675 to 1729—has a uniquely gendered “rhetoric of the body” when it comes to the cycle of rebirth and suffering (84). In addition, Schaeffer’s nuanced presentation of Orgyan Chokyi’s life story provides a fascinating window into the cultural history of seventeenth-century women and men in the western Himalayas.

Part II moves on to address “Modern Tibetan Women,” with all five articles focusing on women’s experiences within the contemporary TAR (although several of them also incorporate material from exile communities). Hildegard Diemberger’s article on female oracles will certainly become the definitive work on the subject, with its discussions of both “old” and “new” oracles based on oral histories and extensive fieldwork. Although not all oracles are female, Diemberger argues that “the ability to resolve personal life-crises and to deal with social liminality by means of spirit possession seems to be connected to a female experience of life in a privileged and specific way” (167). Diemberger describes the experiences and practices of this powerful group of women, as well as exploring their links with contemporary religious and social movements.

Turning to a different but equally powerful role that several women have played within contemporary Tibetan society, Tashi Tsering looks at the contributions of women doctors to Tibetan medicine. With biographies of Khando Yanga, Lobsang Dolma Khangkar, and Tsewang Dolkar Khangkar, this chapter is translated from the original Tibetan and its rhetorical style echoes a traditional Tibetan religious biography. In that vein, we learn about the key events that defined these three illustrious women’s lives, and come to understand them as key figures in maintaining Tibetan medical traditions both in pre-1959 Tibet and in exile.

With a somewhat similar organizational structure, Isabelle Henrion-Dourcy’s article profiles six contemporary female singers. The details of their life stories are skillfully contextualized in a broader discussion of the role of performing arts in asserting Tibetan identities, both within the TAR and in exile. Henrion-Dourcy concludes that for the female performers in question, “ethnicity issues have appeared to have precedence over gender issues” (258). This serves as a crucial reminder that even in studies of women,

gender may not be the most appropriate analytical framework; rather gender identities must always be understood in relation to other identities. For the female Tibetan performers that Henrion-Dourcy describes, ethnic and national identity issues have often been so highly charged that they have eclipsed gender as defining categories.

By contrast, the nuns of Labrang, Amdo who are the subject of Charlene Makley’s theoretically sophisticated article are defined and often limited by their female bodies. Makley argues that the seemingly androgynous, but ultimately female bodies of these celibate women came to symbolize the “larger patterns of changing gender practices which locals experienced as baffling and multifarious” (284). In so doing, they were perceived as a dangerous affront to existing gender ideologies.

In his extremely detailed review of women in contemporary TAR politics, Robbie Barnett makes a similar argument about the politicization of women’s bodies, claiming that ultimately their bodies serve as “symbols of their cultural distinctiveness and of their identity as a group or nation” (362). Due to restrictions on expression, women’s bodies have become a primary site for the performance of political ritual, the one location that cannot be policed. Barnett applies this argument to both female Communist Party members and anti-state protesters, and shows how women across a broad spectrum of political roles and affiliations have engaged with politics in an embodied manner. Both theoretically complex and ethnographically rich, Barnett’s chapter provides a powerful conclusion to the volume as a whole.

All in all, *Women in Tibet* offers a wealth of data about disparate Tibetan women across time and space. One category that regrettably remains unrepresented is that of contemporary Tibetan women scholars: despite several mentions of the well-known Lhasa scholar Tseyang Changngopa, there is not a single contribution from one of the many women of Tibetan origin producing fine scholarship in China, India, and the rest of the world. Nonetheless, no single book can be all things to all people, and the excellent individual articles presented in this volume will pave the way for more integrated studies of women’s experiences in Tibetan contexts, by scholars both Tibetan and Western, female and male.

Sara Shneiderman is currently completing her doctoral dissertation in cultural anthropology at Cornell University. She has worked on issues of gender, ethnic, religious and political identity in the Himalayas for over ten years.